Working Paper No. 05-14

The Job Guarantee feasibility study: preliminary findings

Emma Allen

November 2005
1. Introduction

This paper is part of the Australian Research Council funded research project title ‘Creating effective local labour markets: A new framework for regional employment policy.’ This research, undertaken by CofFEE in collaboration with Jobs Australia, is motivated by a desire to address current policy failure to restore full employment and to develop an economy that allows equitable outcomes for all. In order to facilitate the convergence of these goals, our investigation will be largely concerned with further articulating and developing ‘The Job Guarantee’, a model developed by the centre that outlines a sustainable path to full employment with price stability (Mitchell et al., 2003).

The state of the economy today is largely reported in positive terms. Frequently, we hear news of ‘unemployment reaching thirty year lows’ and are told that our economy is booming (Costello, 2005:8). Despite the abundance of good news stories, the reality is that there are over 540 000 people who are officially unemployed (ABS, 2005). The story becomes even grimmer when hidden unemployment and underemployment are taken into consideration, revealing that approximately 1.1 million Australians are currently without sufficient work (Mitchell & Carlson, 2000).

Much of the discussion disseminating from the media draws on comparisons between different temporalities, referring most frequently to a point of international economic crisis that occurred thirty years ago and today’s economic conditions. In this context the narrative as told by mainstream discourse, reveals that today’s Australian story is particularly prosperous. Poignantly, the prosperous economy that Australia sustained prior to 1975 is consistently referred to as the ‘Golden Era’, a label that attaches a notion of impossibility, implying restoration of the prosperous economic conditions to be unattainable.

Some would even like to return to the so-called golden era of the 50s and 60s. However, there is a need to recognise the nature of our economic situation as a small trading nation in a changing world, dependent on trade to maintain our living standards (Samuel, 2002: 10).

Between 1945 and 1975 full employment was a fundamental aim of the Commonwealth Government (Coombs, 1994:10). During this period the government was able to maintain an unemployment rate that was usually below two per cent. This was largely achieved through the usage of expansionary budget policies, which supported investment in areas such as health, education and public infrastructure, and resulted in growth in public employment. During this time the government also maintained a ‘buffer stock’ capacity, which consisted of low/unskilled jobs that were available and accessible for any worker. The policy goal of full employment created employment conditions that were steady, where employees the opportunity to change employment and ‘secure prospects unmarred by the fear of idleness and the dole,’ (Full employment in Australia, 1945, paragraph 6).

The goal of the Job Guarantee (JG) is to restore this buffer stock capacity (Mitchell et al., 2003: 9). This would ensure that at any given time people would have opportunities to earn an income and preserve their independence. JG employment would be primarily concerned with addressing unmet need in areas of community development and environmental protection. These two areas are seen to be ideal targets for JG employment ‘as they are likely to be under-produced by the private sector due to heavy public good components …’ (Mitchell et al., 2003: 10).
There is a growing realisation that programs, which focus on promoting employability and enhancing the competitiveness of regions, cannot alone achieve the fundamental objectives that they were designed to address, namely improving employment prospects, enhancing social conditions and the stimulation of local economies (Randolph, 2004: 64). The failure of these policies to generate prosperity is evidenced in the relative rise in poverty in Australia (Coombs and Dollery, 2004: 462), the persistence of unemployment, with after fourteen years of sustained economic growth, there are still 3.8 unemployed people for every job vacancy (CofFEE, 2005).

Promotion of regional competitiveness is a significant policy goal, however, much of the literature that narrates competitiveness theory suffers from a ‘success story’ bias. For instance, concepts driving New Regionalism are primarily concerned with explaining why and how various regions have become prosperous, while neglecting to offer a rationale explaining why some regions don’t prosper (Lovering, 1999: 391). Moreover, many policy of these interventions create their understanding of how to support regional competitiveness through measures of business density, clustering, entrepreneurship, innovation and knowledge intensity (Bristow, 2005: 290). These measures approach the development of policy through an angle that focuses on development in a region rather than development of a region (Lovering, 2001: 351).

Therefore, one of the objectives of the linkage project between Jobs Australia and CofFEE will be to further develop an alternative narrative that will seek to reduce regional disadvantage, and be meaningful within landscapes that do not possess specific qualities that are needed to foster innovation, as well as landscapes that are successful within the current policy framework. We emphasise that while the JG model does not represent a complete regional development strategy, it should be an essential part of all regional development strategies, as inherent within strategies aimed at induced regional development should be the logic ‘that improving competitiveness should involve alleviating poverty,’ as the persistence of poverty will ‘hold back efforts to enhance competitiveness,’ (Bristow, 2005: 295).

The current study seeks to investigate the potential new employment opportunities that could be undertaken in a JG context. A key part of the research will be a survey of local governments to identify potential job opportunities that could be undertaken by low/unskilled workers. The aim of this is to articulate the nature of the employment and to quantify potential employment opportunities in areas of community development and environmental protection that would be accessible to low/unskilled workers. This paper reports on preliminary findings from survey research. The remainder of the paper has been divided into three sections. The next section focuses on methodology while the following section discusses the results derived from the preliminary study. The final section discusses what early conclusions can be drawn and the challenges that lie ahead for researchers in developing a final survey instrument.

2. Methodology

2.1 Introduction

The underlying objective for undertaking this research was to investigate the feasibility of implementing a JG. Researchers originally had several objectives that they wanted to achieve from conducting survey research; however, these objectives were narrowed to two core objectives in light of preliminary findings from the study. There will be further discussion of this later in this section. The first objective of the
study sought to quantify the number of potential JG employment opportunities that exist within each local government Australia wide. The second intention was to develop a JG employment paradigm, which would function as a support resource, offering stimulus for the identification of various potential JG employment opportunities.

Conducting research through a survey medium was determined to be the most feasible option for the necessary collection of the data, as the methodology would allow participants to give in depth responses, while also allowing the study to operate at a national scale. However, the topic of the study had not been investigated through survey methodology previously, and thus an original survey instrument and processes had to be developed.

The sample that we proposed to conduct our study with were local government bodies throughout Australia. Local governments were chosen as they have extensive and detailed information about issues of need within their discrete area of governance. This is evidenced through the production of local government documents, such as ‘The State of the Environment Report’, annual reports and ‘Social and Community plans.’ Other potential samples, such as ‘Conservation Australia,’ ‘Meals on Wheels,’ and other organisations involved with environmental and community activities, were considered to be a problematic due to their specialised interest areas and also their ill defined geographical context.

Key informants from ‘Work for the Dole’ were originally involved in the sample to enhance the quality of the costing section of the survey. However, after conducting preliminary interviews and considering various literatures, it was decided that information obtained relating to costing for the purpose of this survey would produce inaccurate and variable data (See Beer et al., 2003 for in depth examination of costing items in survey research). It was therefore decided that questions relating to costing would be investigated at a later date through an alternative methodology and sample.

In order to ensure a quality research design it was necessary to undertake a comprehensive pretesting and evaluation of the research objectives, processes and instruments. This involved conducting a literature review, which investigated best practice in survey design and implementation; Holding focus groups with fellow researchers; and the involvement of a sample from the survey population in a pretesting and evaluation study, which would comprise of a preliminary interview, a the pilot survey, and a post pilot interview.

2.2 Technique Rationale

The undertaking of this research required the development of a unique survey instrument and process. International best practice of design methods were therefore consulted in order to ensure the development of a quality survey process. Given that the survey would be conducted nation wide, the administration of the survey could take either an electronic or postal format. Review of literature revealed several advantages in favour of conducting a web-based study.

For instance, research comparing web and postal surveys indicates that comparable response rates are achieved when the surveys are preceded by an advance mail notification (Kaplowitz et al., 2004: 100). Further research comparing the two methods indicates that web-based studies have higher rates of whole questionnaire completion, and also benefit from reduced response time, with the majority of survey responses received within fifteen days (Couper et al., 2001: 42, Cobanoglu et al.,
These are important points, as ‘non-response or non-completion of questionnaires is a major problem in survey research’ (Drennan, 2002: 7), as the collection of incomplete data limits the application of the findings. Web-based studies also eliminate data entry problems, such as human error, as much of the processing is automatic and software can be programmed to run generate automatic reports (Cobanoglu et al., 2001: 41).

Furthermore, the participant sample, who are employees of Local Governments, meet the basic criteria that are required in order to conduct web-based survey, as all participants have equitable access to Internet facilities and all have a stable email account that is checked regularly (Cobanoglu et al., 2001:441). In order to maximise survey response follow up contacts will be made with survey participants. Literature recommends researchers vary contact techniques that they implement when conducting study follow-ups. Possible techniques include email, telephone, postal or fax; additionally selecting a variation of these techniques, rather than repeating the same technique, is shown to increase response rates.

2.3 The Pretesting and Evaluation Structure

An extensive pretesting and evaluation of the study was constructed in order to ensure a quality research process. The pretesting and evaluation of the study consisted of a preliminary interview, a pilot survey and a post pilot interview. The sample that the preliminary study would be conducted with was determined from the local government classification system, a taxonomy that organises local governments into twenty-two comparable categories developed by the Australian department of transport and road services (DOTARS) and also the proximity of the local government to the University of Newcastle. Nineteen local governments were invited to participate in the study. This ensured that the survey sample reflected the composition of the main survey population, and also spatial differences that would be experienced in the quantum and type of JG employment that would be needed within diverse landscapes.

The preliminary interview was conducted in a semi-structured format, and sought to investigate participant knowledge and response to concepts that were core to the investigation. Participants were first asked about their involvement with labour market programs, and then about potential employment opportunities within their local government area that could address unmet need within environmental protection and community development. Finally, participants were asked about the administrative and managerial capacity of local government to operate the JG program. The interviews sought to identify the appropriate survey population or position title that the study should be directed towards; to develop a list of examples of JG jobs that could be used as examples throughout the survey instrument; and to assess the capacity of human and material resources to facilitate the program.

After all the preliminary interviews were completed, researchers reflected over the information gathered and used this information to modify the proposed survey. Approximately one week after partaking in the online survey, the sample then were asked to participate in a post pilot interview, which was developed using cognitive interviewing techniques; a style of interviewing that seeks to investigate the thought processes elicited by the study (Presser et al., 2004: 112). After evaluating the information and comments gathered from the pre-testing processes, a final version of the survey will be submits to ethics for approval.
2.4 Focus Groups with Fellow Researchers

After preliminary interviews were conducted with the sample the proposed survey instrument was underwent revision. The purpose of this was to develop an instrument that would be more ‘user friendly,’ while also allowing the objectives of the study to be achieved effectively. This led researchers to reassess the objectives of the survey.

Originally, the quantitative study was intended to develop both costings for the JG model, while also identifying the quantum of employment opportunities available that would be suitable for JG participants and obtain information about the types of tasks that would constitute JG employment opportunities. However, preliminary interviews with study participants revealed that the multiple goals of the study would result in the development of an instrument that was onerous and time consuming. Interviewees suggested that if the multiple goals of the survey were to be achieved, several different employees from across council would need to be involved in completion of various sections, in order to ensure the reliability of the information given. Such requirements would have serious implications upon the response rate and also the completion time. It was decided that construction of a survey instrument that would take approximately thirty minutes to complete was vital to the success of the study. Therefore, objectives of the study narrowed to focus on identifying the quantum of potential JG employment opportunities and the nature of these potential employment opportunities.

2.5 Survey Format

It was agreed that developing participant understanding of the JG model would be crucial to the success of the study. Therefore, a survey web-page was developed, which would allow the sample to access information on the JG model, as well as information required by university ethics. The first item of the survey also focused on developing model knowledge, and asked participants to confirm their understanding of the model.

Of equal importance to the study was participant understanding of the scale that JG would need to operate at within each local government area. Therefore, to allow participants to imagine the scale of the model an item listing number of unemployed people by local government area was developed. These unemployment figures were taken from the department of Employment and Workplace Relations publication, ‘Small Area Labour Markets.’

The remainder of the survey was split into community development and environmental protection sections. In order to reduce survey completion time participants were only required to complete one of these two sections. The remaining items focused on the identification of all priority tasks within environmental protection or community development that were not being addressed by public or private sectors, or tasks that were being undertaken but not at a level which satisfies need.

Environmental protection and community development were both divided into six response categories. The responses categories for the environmental protection section of the survey were developed from the ‘Local Government Environment and Natural Resources Survey’ conducted by the Australia Bureau of Statistics (ABS) biennially. Response categories consisted of: waste water management, solid waste management, protection of soil and groundwater, conservation of biodiversity and habitat, protection of cultural heritage and other environmental protection.
There was no standard community development classification system available to draw upon, therefore response categories for the community development section were largely developed from two resources; the ABS ‘Australian System of Government Finance Statistics, Concepts, Sources and Methods,’ and the New South Wales Department of Local Government’s ‘Social/Community planning and reporting guidelines.’ Response categories consisted of: transport amenities, recreation and culture, community amenities, welfare services, public health and safety and other community development. These categories and sub-categories were defined in an online glossary.

The final section of the survey required participants to reflect over areas of need that they had identified, and determine which of these needs could be met through the employment of low/unskilled workers. Using a matrix table (see Table 1. below), which listed low/unskilled occupations in accordance with the ABS Australian Standard Classification of Occupation (ASCO), the survey asked the sample to quantify the number of low/unskilled workers that could be employed within their local government area to meet needs that they had identified in previous questions.

Table 1 Example of question format

Using the following matrix, please estimate the number of full-time equivalent permanent low/unskilled workers that could be used to meet community development need within your LGA PER ANNUM.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupation type by ASCO</th>
<th>Transport amenities</th>
<th>Recreation &amp; culture</th>
<th>Community amenities</th>
<th>Welfare services</th>
<th>Public health/safety</th>
<th>Other community development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Carer/Aide</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elementary clerk</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elementary sales</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elementary Service</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cleaner</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction labourer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture/horticulture labourer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elementary food preparation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miscellaneous labourer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Worker</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The survey concluded with a list of closed ended questions, which sought to validate the data provided throughout the document.

3. Results

3.1 Description of response

The pretesting and evaluation phase of the JG feasibility study involved a survey population from selected local governments across New South Wales, Australia. The sample frame involved a range local of government employees from different positions, including economic development managers, human resource managers,
community officers and social planners, across councils. Participants were required to develop JG employment opportunities in either community development or environmental protection. Of the fifteen local governments that were invited to participate thirteen attempted the survey. Twelve of these thirteen selected to develop JG employment opportunities within community development.

Eight participants fully completed the survey, while the five remaining participants, including the one participant who chose to develop JG employment opportunities in environmental protection, only partially completed the survey. Participants who had partial survey completions did not attempt any of the open-ended response questions. During follow up interviews it was revealed these participants felt they lacked the specific knowledge that was needed to respond to the items, therefore their partial completions could be attributed to a coverage error. This was due to the inclusion of a range of different local government employees, who held different positions across the council. The purpose of this was to investigate the most appropriate sample to involve in the formal study.

Participants consistently indicated that the most appropriate person to target the ‘community development’ survey towards would be ‘social planning officers’ or ‘community liaison officers.’ Participants reported that people in these positions would have much more interaction with community members and would also be involved in developing council documents, such as the ‘Social and Community Plans,’ and therefore be able to offer much more insight into unmet community needs, as well as being able to provide potentially more accurate, reliable responses. Participants who were involved in such a role in their employment with local governments were able to produce meaningfully responses to item in the survey instrument. Other participants had to refer back to their social plan in order to provide a more informed response.

Participants also hypothesised that items relating to environmental protection would be best posed towards environmental health officers or personnel who played key roles in the development of the compulsory ‘State of the Environment’ report or the Survey titled ‘Local Government Environment and Natural Resources Survey’ conducted by the Australia Bureau of Statistics biennially.

3.2 Preliminary results

An overview of the results will first be sketched out, and then results will be discussed in detail in their respective community development subcategories.

The eight completed survey responses represented 14,734 unemployed people for the June quarter of 2005 (DEWR, 2005). Table 2 reveals that the total number of potential Community Development JG employment opportunities that respondents reported was 1,990, this represented 13.5 per cent of people unemployed in their local government areas. The discrepancy of reported potential employment opportunities in proportion to unemployed ranged from 2.25 per cent to 60.89 per cent.

Results from the preliminary study indicate that there is considerable need within our community, particularly within welfare services, that is not currently being undertaken or undertaken at a level that would satisfy the need. Participants also indicated that the needs outlined throughout the survey were unlikely to be addressed by agents within their area without additional funding.
Table 2: Comparing number of unemployed to potential JG employment opportunities identified by survey participants by Local Government Area.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Local Government Area</th>
<th>Number unemployed</th>
<th>Potential Job Guarantee employment</th>
<th>Job Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Blue Mountains City</td>
<td>1730</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>2.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tamworth Regional Council</td>
<td>1429</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>2.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lake Macquarie</td>
<td>5274</td>
<td>1002</td>
<td>19.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lanecove</td>
<td>450</td>
<td>274</td>
<td>60.89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Singleton</td>
<td>362</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>8.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gloucester</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>16.53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dungog</td>
<td>149</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>24.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wyong</td>
<td>5219</td>
<td>550</td>
<td>10.54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>14734</td>
<td>1990</td>
<td>13.51</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Throughout the study all participants made note of deficits within the provision of welfare throughout their communities, and estimated the existence of 550 (27%) potential job opportunities that could be taken up by low/unskilled workers. Participants also showed concern for lack of facilities for youth and gaps in the provision of assistance to facilitate community inclusion, and estimated that it would be possible to employ 396 (20%) low/unskilled workers to meet the need currently experience by their community, see figure 1. below.

Figure 1: Percentage of Community Development Job Guarantee Employment Opportunities by Sub-Category
Results, as shown in Figure 2, revealed that the most common potential employment opportunities for low/unskilled workers in community development would be within a position as a carer/aide, such as an educational aide, home support worker or a personal care assistant. Participants estimated the possible creation of 554 employment opportunities in this area. The preliminary results also indicated need for providers of elementary services, such as caretakers, domestic keepers, railway assistant and crossing supervisors; with the possibility of creation of 351 employment opportunities in this area.

Figure 2: Percentage of Community Development Job Guarantee Employment Opportunities by Occupation Type

Table 3 provides a detailed overview of the preliminary survey results by subcategory and item breakdown.
Table 3 Summary of results from the preliminary JG feasibility study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Community Development sub-category</th>
<th>Existing need within community development</th>
<th>Tasks that could be undertaken by low unskilled workers</th>
<th>Main area of potential employment opportunity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Transport Amenity</td>
<td>Linkage services between and within local government areas for people with special needs and elderly people, with the purpose of facilitating weekly grocery shopping and the meeting of medical appointments; Building rail/bus route links and the updating signage.</td>
<td>Maintenance; Driving; Escorting; Couriering; Installing of signage; Assisting various transport operations.</td>
<td>Carers/aides and elementary service workers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recreation and Culture</td>
<td>Upgrading and maintenance of public facilities, the construction and maintenance of skate parks, bicycle tracks and events facilities and free after school care</td>
<td>Restoration and maintenance of parks and wetlands; Construction, maintenance and staffing of bicycle tracks, skate parks and heritage walks; Investigation and restoration of historical records; Assisting participation of the community</td>
<td>Carers/aides, cleaners and agricultural/horticultural labourers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Amenity</td>
<td>Interpreting services, maintenance of cemeteries, maintenance of amenity, youth training and entertainment, and assisting community participation.</td>
<td>Cleaning of community amenities; Cemetery maintenance; Security activities; Administration and update of community registries.</td>
<td>Elementary clerks, cleaners and agricultural/horticultural labourers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Welfare Services</td>
<td>Gaps in the support and provision of crisis services and accommodation, a lack of respite and support for carers, lack of ‘face to face’ home visits made by health care professionals to new mothers and families in distress, as well as lack of visitors to people in hospitals and nursing homes.</td>
<td>Preparation and delivery of food; Visitation of people in nursing homes and hospitals; Aid in the repair and maintenance of homes of targeted populations; Aid in the creation, restoration, maintenance and cleaning of crisis accommodation and hostels.</td>
<td>Carers/aides, elementary service workers, and cleaners.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Health and Safety</td>
<td>Basic billing services, street lighting, police presence, upgrading of water facilities, public dental services, support of road safety, child health and exercise programs and support for rural fire services (RFS) and state emergency services (SES).</td>
<td>Maintenance of infrastructure (SES and RFS); Provision of transportation and transportation aides to various medical services, Provision of supervision and accompaniment of students to walk between home and school.</td>
<td>Elementary service workers and cleaners.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Community Development</td>
<td>Affordable housing, out of hours playgroups, streetscaping, landscaping, the development of water facilities and business incubators.</td>
<td>Labouring jobs; Event organising; Update of signage; Tree planting and landscaping/streetscaping activities.</td>
<td>Elementary service workers, elementary clerks, and other low/unskilled workers.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4. Discussion

The preliminary findings from this study reveal two important points, the first relates to continuities in research that indicate gaps in the provision of welfare services; the second finding is a little more abstract and relates to the effect of bound rationality on participants understanding of need and scale.

4.1 Service Provision

There are a myriad of community services provided through government, private and volunteering sectors that are aimed to enable the independent living of older people and people with special needs. However, despite the services that are available for aged care and people with special needs, the results from this preliminary study have found that there are still considerable gaps in the provision of services for these people. Findings from this preliminary study also suggest that it would be possible to meet some community needs through the creation of low/unskilled employment opportunities, especially for carers/aides, caretakers and domestic keepers. The employment opportunities that the sample identified throughout the preliminary study would be accessible to the majority of unemployed persons.

The findings from this study are consistent with other reports that have investigated community needs, in that the results match up with previously identified gaps in service provision; such as the unpublished report for the Hunter Area Assistance Scheme prepared by Bill et al. (2004), which found that in spite of the presence of local initiative and supportive infrastructures, the community still reported that there were needs and social impacts which remained to be addressed. Additional research by the ABS Survey of Disability, Ageing and Carers, found that over 950000 people with disability felt their needs were only partly met or not met at all (ABS, 2003: 6).

Further compounding the problem is the claim from local governments and other community organisations that funding is becoming more competitive and targeted to proposed outcomes, while also becoming increasingly intermittent and non-continual (Hunter Valley Research Foundation, 2005: 3). Local governments report that these funding trends have seen the neglect of local and specialised needs, and the development of a funding bias towards larger organisations. This reality illustrates that agencies are being rewarded for becoming more competitive and responding at lower costs, but in the same instance are denied the funding, resources and ability to address fundamental issues that are core to their organisation. The consequence of this binary function has resulted in a growing pressure upon local governments, as the public increasingly expects this agency to fill the gaps caused by the reduced capacity of other organisations to deliver community services (NCC, 2005).

The perceived problematic nature of funding has the effect of placing constraints on what applicants may deem possible. This leads councils and community organisations to frame their proposals and build outcomes in a way that would increase the likelihood of achieving success in funding rounds. The process becomes guided by perceived possibility, instead of actual need. Possibility eventually adjusts into line with what one deems feasible and achievable (Earl, 2005: 914). This leads into the final point.

4.2 Bounded Rationality

The results from the preliminary study revealed that for some reason the sample generally had a conservative understanding of the scale of need within their
community. The scale of need described by the sample is contrary to the scale of need that the aforementioned studies had identified. To illustrate this point, several participants reported that employment of another one or two carer/aides would satisfy unmet need within their community. Given the scale of need that the ABS described in their study of Disability, Ageing and Carers (1998), it would seem unreasonable to imagine that provision for another one or two carers would suffice.

Some respondents were much more unconstrained in their imagination of the scale of JG. Interestingly, it was revealed in later interviews that these respondents had been involved in job creation programs in one form or another previously. This is particularly intriguing as it suggests that participants have responded to the study with specific perceptions framing their responses, or in other words, participant ability to respond was affected by their rational bounds, bounded what participants deem feasible and possible.

Bounded rationality explains that decision-making processes, and the information that people use to aid them in this process, does not necessarily result in rational responses (Earl, 2005: 913). The bounds on human rationality are steered by the incompleteness of knowledge, the prevalence of norms or hegemonic discourse and the costs involved with achieving perfection. Simon (1993: 157) explains that we rely heavily upon norms and hegemony to inform and guide our choices, and that process usually serves us well.

Adorno and Horkheimer (1944) suggest that the more intensely and flawlessly information is portrayed, the easier it becomes for the perceptions that are embedded with the information to prevail as viable and definite truth. The dominance of this ‘truth’ then works in a binary fashion to further guide how understandings are constructed. The existence of norms and hegemony then enable to construction of exclusionary understandings, and deny the possibility of a multiplicity of trajectories (Massey, 1999: 271). The bounds of our rationality become problematic when we are asked to consider alternative possibilities, possibilities that are contrary to the way we understanding the world.

The Job Guarantee model does this very thing; it requires consideration of the possibility of an alternative narrative, it requires consideration of concepts that are contrary to popularised understanding of how the economy works (Mitchell and Wray, 2004). Therefore, despite the fact the present study was constructed in an unconstrained manner participant response was still conservative. There were many more potential employment opportunities that could be undertaken by low/unskilled workers that participants failed to include in their responses.

5. Implications for further research

The preliminary finds from the JG feasibility study have allowed researchers to identify the target survey population within local governments and have also provided insights into how participants are likely to respond to the items proposed to them throughout the survey. These insights will be used to guide the development of a revised survey instrument. The preliminary study has also identified a distinct set of challenges for researchers to come to grips in the development of the final survey instrument; namely the effect that bounded rationality has on the ability of participants to produce meaningful and accurate responses that reflect the need existing within their community.
So, when conducting investigations that pose an alternative narrative, how do create a space that facilitates possibility? How does one attempt to investigate and address needs and disadvantage when there are prominent norms and accepted beliefs that people use to augment their limited rationality?

**References**


Mitchell, W. and Carlson, E. (2000) Beyond the Unemployment Rate - labour underutilisation and underemployment in Australia and the USA, Working Paper 00-06, Centre of Full Employment and


---

1 The author is a PhD student at the Centre of Full Employment and Equity at the University of Newcastle, Australia. She is being funded by ARC Linkage Project LP045210.